

# APPROXIMATE SEQUENCES VERSUS INVERSE SEQUENCES (\*)

by N. UGLEŠIĆ (in Split)(\*\*)

SOMMARIO. - *In questa nota si costruisce una sequenza inversa approssimata  $\mathcal{X} = (P_n, \varepsilon_n, P_{nn'}, \mathbb{N})$  di continui planari poliedrali  $P_n$  in maniera tale che  $\mathcal{X}$  e la sequenza (commutativa) inversa corrispondente  $\underline{X} = (P_n, p_{n,n+1}, \mathbb{N})$  abbiano limiti non omeomorfi. Si ha così un miglioramento essenziale di un precedente esempio del medesimo autore relativo a continui planari non poliedrali.*

SUMMARY. - *An approximate inverse sequence  $\mathcal{X} = (P_n, \varepsilon_n, P_{nn'}, \mathbb{N})$  of polyhedral planar continua  $P_n$  is constructed, such that  $\mathcal{X}$  and the corresponding (commutative) inverse sequence  $\underline{X} = (P_n, p_{n,n+1}, \mathbb{N})$  have non-homeomorphic limits. This is an essential improvement of the author's previous example, which consisted of non-polyhedral planar continua.*

## 1. Introduction.

S. Mardešić and L.R. Rubin [4] introduced the notion of an approximate inverse system of metric compacta  $\mathcal{X} = (X_a, \varepsilon_a, p_{aa'}, A)$ . They replaced (weakened) the commutativity condition  $p_{aa'}p_{a'a''} = p_{aa''}$ ,  $a \leq a' \leq a''$ , by the following three requirements:

- A1)  $d(p_{aa'}p_{a'a''}, p_{aa''}) \leq \varepsilon_a$  whenever  $a \leq a' \leq a''$ ;
- A2)  $(\forall a \in A)(\forall \eta > 0)(\exists a' \geq a)(\forall a_2 \geq a_1 \geq a')$   
 $d(p_{aa_1}p_{a_1a_2}, p_{aa_2}) \leq \eta$ ;
- A3)  $(\forall a' \in A)(\forall \eta > 0)(\exists a' \geq a)(\forall a'' \geq a')$   
 $(\forall x, x' \in X_{a''}) d(x, x') \leq \varepsilon_{a''} \Rightarrow d(p_{aa''}(x), p_{aa''}(x')) \leq \eta$ .

---

(\*) Pervenuto in Redazione il 28 dicembre 1993 ed in versione definitiva il 18 aprile 1994.

(\*\*) Indirizzo dell'Autore: Department of Mathematics, University of Split, Teslina 12/III, 58000 Split (Croazia).

An approximate map  $q$  of a space  $Y$  into an approximate system  $\mathcal{X} = (X_a, \varepsilon_a, p_{aa'}, A)$ ,  $q : Y \rightarrow \mathcal{X}$ , is a collection  $q = \{q_a | a \in A\} = (q_a)$  of mappings  $q_a : Y \rightarrow X_a$  satisfying the following condition:

$$(AS) (\forall a \in A) (\forall \eta > 0) (\exists a' \geq a) (\forall a'' \geq a') d(q_a, p_{aa''} q_{a''}) \leq \eta.$$

An approximate map  $p = (p_a) : X \rightarrow \mathcal{X}$  is called a limit of  $\mathcal{X}$  provided it has the following universal property:

(UL) For any approximate map  $q : Y \rightarrow \mathcal{X}$  there exists a unique mapping  $g : Y \rightarrow X$  satisfying  $p_a g = q_a$ , for every  $a \in A$ .

Since a limit space  $X$  is determined up to a unique homeomorphism, we often speak of the limit  $X$  of  $\mathcal{X}$  and we write  $X = \lim \mathcal{X}$ .

Moreover, Mardešić and Rubin analogously defined the notion of an approximate inverse system of compact Hausdorff spaces as well as of its limit. Here, of course, the role of the numbers  $\varepsilon_a > 0$  and  $\eta > 0$  is taken over by open coverings  $\mathcal{U}_a$  and  $\mathcal{U}$  of  $X_a$ ,  $a \in A$ , respectively. They established a very important theorem (which does not hold in the commutative case), [4]: A compact Hausdorff space  $X$  has covering dimension  $\dim X \leq n$  if and only if  $X$  is the limit of an approximate inverse system of compact polyhedra  $X_a$  with  $\dim X_a \leq n$ .

M.G. Charalambous [1] was the first to consider (nongauged) approximate systems satisfying only condition (A2). Subsequently S. Mardešić [2] and the author [16] showed that these systems are equivalent to the (gauged) approximate systems.

The theory of approximate systems, as well as their applications, has been further intensively developed by S. Mardešić and J. Segal [6], [7], [8], S. Mardešić and L.R. Rubin [5], S. Mardešić and T. Watanabe [11], T. Watanabe [17], S. Mardešić [2], S. Mardešić and V. Matijević [3], V. Matijević [12], V. Matijević and N. Uglešić [13], N. Uglešić [15], [16], S. Mardešić and N. Uglešić [9], [10] and others.

## 2. Example.

When S. Mardešić started studying approximate systems, he asked the following question:

Let  $\mathcal{X} = (X_n, \varepsilon_n, p_{nn'}, \mathbb{N})$  be an approximate inverse sequence with limit  $\lim \mathcal{X} = X$ . Let  $\underline{\mathcal{X}} = (X_n, p_{n,n+1}, \mathbb{N})$  be the usual (commutative) inverse sequence obtained by replacing in  $\mathcal{X}$  each  $p_{nn'}$ ,  $n' - n \geq 1$ , by the composition  $p'_{nn'} = p_{n,n+1} \circ \dots \circ p_{n'-1,n'}$ . Is  $\lim \underline{\mathcal{X}}$  homeomorphic to  $X$ ?

The next result of M.G. Charalambous ([1], Proposition 8) addresses

directly the above question:

Let  $X = (X_n, p_{nn'}, \mathbb{N})$  be an approximate sequence of complete metric spaces (in particular, metric compacta) with limit  $\lim X = X$ . Then  $X$  is uniformly isomorphic (hence, homeomorphic) to the limit  $\lim \underline{X}'$ , where  $\underline{X}' = (X_m, p'_{mm'}, M)$  is the usual inverse sequence over some cofinal subset  $M \subseteq \mathbb{N}$ , where  $p'_{mm'} = p_{mm'}$ , whenever  $m'$  is an immediate successor of  $m$  in  $M$ .

Although this result suggests to answer the above question affirmatively, the author showed that it is not the case ([15], Example (2.3)). The counterexample, having its roots in [6], Example 1, has been constructed out of terms which are all equal to the same planar continuum - the Hawaiian earring  $H$ . Here we will obtain an improvement of that example, which consists in replacing  $H$  by compact connected planar polyhedra  $P_n, n \in \mathbb{N}$ , where  $P_n$  is the wedge of a compact polyhedral disc and  $n$  polyhedral circles.

EXAMPLE 2.3. Let  $S^1 = \{z \in \mathbb{C} \mid |z| = 1\}$  be the standard unit circle in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ . Consider for each  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ , the following four points  $(\xi_k, \eta_k)_j \in \mathbb{R}^2, j = 1, 2, 3, 4$ :

$$\begin{aligned} &((k - 1)/k, 0), (k/(k + 1), -1/k(k + 1)), \\ &(1, 0) = x_0, (k/(k + 1), 1/k(k + 1)) . \end{aligned}$$

Let  $D_k \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2, k \in \mathbb{N}$ , be the convex hull of these four points. Then each  $D_k$  is a polyhedral disc,  $D_1 \supseteq D_2 \supseteq D_k \supseteq \dots$  and  $\bigcap_{k \in \mathbb{N}} D_k = \{x_0\}$ . Let  $C_k$  be the boundary of  $D_k, k \in \mathbb{N}$ . Notice that  $\text{diam}(C_k) = \text{diam}(D_k) = 1/k$ . For every  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ , choose the homeomorphism  $h_k : C_k \rightarrow S^1$  defined by the radial projection from the interior point  $((2k - 1)/2k, 0)$  of  $D_k$ . Let

$$P_n = \left( \bigcup_{k=1}^n C_k \right) \cup D_{n+1} \subset \mathbb{R}^2, \quad n \in \mathbb{N},$$

with the euclidean metric  $d$ . Obviously,  $P_1 \supseteq P_2 \supseteq \dots \supseteq P_n \supseteq \dots$  is a sequence of compact connected polyhedra in  $\mathbb{R}^2$ . Let us define the sequence of mappings  $\varphi_n : P_{n+1} \rightarrow P_n, n \in \mathbb{N}$ , by putting

$$\varphi_n(x) = \begin{cases} x, & x \in P_{n+1} \setminus C_{n+1} , \\ h_n^{-1}(h_{n+1}(x)^2), & x \in C_{n+1} . \end{cases}$$

Observe that  $\varphi_n(C_n \cup C_{n+1}) = \varphi_n(C_{n+1}) = C_n, n \in \mathbb{N}$ . If  $n' \geq n+2$ , denote by  $i_{nn'}$  the inclusion mapping of  $P_{n'}$  into  $P_n$ . Now, we define mappings

$p_{nn'} : P_{n'} \rightarrow P_n, n' \geq n$ , by

$$p_{nn'} = \begin{cases} id, & n' = n, \\ \varphi_n, & n' = n + 1, \\ i_{nn'}, & n' \geq n + 2. \end{cases}$$

Finally, let  $\varepsilon_n = 1/n, n \in \mathbb{N}$ .

LEMMA 2.4.  $\mathcal{X} = (P_n, \varepsilon_n, p_{nn'}, \mathbb{N})$  is an approximate sequence.

*Proof.* We have to verify conditions (A1), (A2) and (A3).

(A1). Let  $n \leq n' \leq n''$  in  $\mathbb{N}$  be given. All the non-trivial cases are the following three:

$$d(p_{nn''), p_{nn'}, p_{n'n''}) = \begin{cases} d(i_{n,n+2}, \varphi_n \varphi_{n+1}), & n'' = n' + 1 = n + 2, \\ d(i_{nn''), \varphi_n | P_{n''}), & n'' > n' + 1 = n + 2, \\ d(i_{n,n'+1}, i_{nn'} \varphi_{n'}), & n'' = n' + 1 > n + 2. \end{cases}$$

In the first case, only the points of  $(C_{n+1} \cup C_{n+2}) \setminus \{x_0\} \subset P_{n+2}$  are moving. Because  $\varphi_n \varphi_{n+1}(C_{n+1} \cup C_{n+2}) = C_n, i_{n,n+2}(C_{n+1} \cup C_{n+2}) = C_{n+1} \cup C_{n+2}$  and  $\text{diam}(C_n \cup C_{n+1} \cup C_{n+2}) = \text{diam}(C_n) = 1/n = \varepsilon_n$ , condition (A1) for  $\mathcal{X}$  is satisfied. In the second (third) case, only the points of  $C_{n+1} \setminus \{x_0\}$  ( $C_{n'+1} \setminus \{x_0\}$ ) are moving. Thus, the same argument applies.

(A2). Let  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\eta > 0$  be given. Choose an  $n_0 \in \mathbb{N}$  such that  $1/n_0 \leq \eta$ . Then  $\varepsilon_{n'} \leq \eta$  whenever  $n' \geq n_0$ . Now take  $n' = \max\{n_0, n + 2\}$ , and let  $n_2 \geq n_1 \geq n'$  be given. Observe that  $p_{nn_1}$  and  $p_{nn_2}$  are the inclusion mappings  $i_{nn_1}$  and  $i_{nn_2}$  respectively. Therefore,

$$d(p_{nn_2}, p_{nn_1} p_{n_1 n_2}) = \begin{cases} d(i_{nn_2}, i_{nn_2}), & n_2 - n_1 \neq 1, \\ d(i_{n,n_1+1}, i_{nn_1} \varphi_{n_1}), & n_2 - n_1 = 1. \end{cases}$$

Only the second case restricted to  $C_{n_1+1} \setminus \{x_0\} \subseteq P_{n_1+1}$  is non-trivial. Because of  $\varphi_{n_1}(C_{n_1+1}) = C_{n_1}, i_{n,n_1+1}(C_{n_1+1}) = C_{n_1+1}$  and  $\text{diam}(C_{n_1} \cup C_{n_1+1}) = \text{diam}(C_{n_1}) = 1/n_1 \leq 1/n' = \varepsilon_{n'} \leq \eta, d(i_{n,n_1+1}, i_{nn_1} \varphi_{n_1}) \leq \eta$  holds true. This verifies condition (A2) for  $\mathcal{X}$ .

(A3). Let  $n \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $\eta > 0$  be given. Choose and  $n_0 \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $n'$  as above, and let  $n'' \geq n'$  be given. Then  $p_{nn''} = i_{nn''}$ . Therefore  $d(x, x') \leq \varepsilon_{n''} = 1/n''$  implies  $d(p_{nn''}(x) p_{nn''}(x')) = d(x, x') \leq 1/n'' \leq 1/n' = \varepsilon_{n'} \leq \eta$ , which establishes condition (A3) for  $\mathcal{X}$ .

Let  $X = \bigcap_{n \in \mathbb{N}} P_n \subseteq \mathbb{R}^2$  and let  $p_n : X \rightarrow P_n, n \in \mathbb{N}$ , be the inclusion mappings. Then one easily verifies that  $p = (p_n) : X \rightarrow \mathcal{X}$  is the limit of  $\mathcal{X}$

(see [11], (1.19) Theorem). Notice that  $X \approx H$ . Let  $\underline{X} = (P_n, p'_{n,n'}, \mathbb{N})$  be the corresponding (commutative) inverse sequence associated with  $\mathcal{X}$ , i.e.

$$p'_{nn'} = \begin{cases} id, & n' = n, \\ \varphi_n \circ \dots \circ \varphi_{n'-1}, & n' > n. \end{cases}$$

As in [6], Example 1, or [15], (2.3) Example, the limit space  $\lim \underline{X}$  contains a copy of the diadic solenoid. Therefore,  $\lim \underline{X}$  cannot be homeomorphic to  $\lim \mathcal{X}$ . This answers our question in the negative.

#### REFERENCES

- [1] CHARALAMBOUS M.G., *Approximate inverse systems of uniform spaces and an application of inverse systems*, Comment. Math. Univ. Carolinae **32** (1991), 551-565.
- [2] MARDEŠIĆ S., *On approximate inverse systems and resolutions*, Fund. Math. **142** (1993), 243-255.
- [3] MARDEŠIĆ S. and MATIJEVIĆ V.,  *$\mathcal{P}$ -like spaces are limits of approximate  $\mathcal{P}$ -resolutions*, Topology Appl. **45** (1992), 189-202.
- [4] MARDEŠIĆ S. and RUBIN L.R., *Approximate inverse systems of compacta and covering dimension*, Pacifica J. Math. **138** (1989), 129-144.
- [5] MARDEŠIĆ S. and RUBIN L.R., *Cell-like mappings and non-metrizable compacta of finite cohomological dimension*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **313** (1989), 53-79.
- [6] MARDEŠIĆ S. and SEGAL J., *Stability of almost commutative inverse systems of compacta*, Topology Appl. **31** (1989), 285-299.
- [7] MARDEŠIĆ S. and SEGAL J.,  *$\mathcal{P}$ -like continua and approximate inverse systems*, Math. Japon. **33** (1988), 895-908.
- [8] MARDEŠIĆ S. and SEGAL J., *Mapping approximate inverse systems of compacta*, Fund. Math. **134** (1990), 73-91.
- [9] MARDEŠIĆ S. and UGLEŠIĆ N., *Approximate inverse systems which admit meshes*, Topology Appl. (to appear).
- [10] MARDEŠIĆ S. and UGLEŠIĆ N., *Morphisms of inverse systems require meshes*, (submitted).
- [11] MARDEŠIĆ S. and WATANABE T., *Approximate resolutions of spaces and mappings*, Glasnik Mat. **24** (44) (1989), 587-637.
- [12] MATIJEVIĆ V., *Spaces having approximate resolutions consisting of finite-dimensional polyhedra* (submitted).
- [13] MATIJEVIĆ V. and UGLEŠIĆ N., *A new approach to the theory of approximate resolutions*, (preprint).
- [14] SEGAL J. and WATANABE T., *Cosmic approximate limits and fixed points*, Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **333** (1992), 1-61.
- [15] UGLEŠIĆ N., *An example in the theory of approximate systems*, Comment. Math. Univ. Carolinae **34** (1993), 575-581.

- [16] UGLEŠIĆ N., *A simple construction of meshes in approximate systems*, Tsukuba J. Math. (to appear).
- [17] WATANABE T., *Approximate resolutions and covering dimension*, Topology Appl. **38** (1991), 147-154.